

Meeting Minutes

California First Responder Network Board

October 11, 2017

Cal OES Public Safety Communications, Sacramento, CA

Barry Fraser, Bay Area Regional Interoperable Communications Systems Authority (BAYRICS)

Bill Hartley, Emergency Medical Services Authority (EMSA)

Scott Howland, California Highway Patrol (CHP)

Jeff Hunter (online), California Police Chiefs Association

Kuo-Wei Lee, California Dept. of Transportation (Caltrans)

Patrick Mallon, California FirstNet Single Point of Contact (SPOC), Cal OES PSC Assistant Director

Susy Orellana-Curtiss, Los Angeles Regional Interoperable Communications System (LA-RICS)

Nathan Trauernicht, California Fire Chiefs Association (CFCA), CalFRN Board Vice-Chair

Adelina Zendejas, California Department of Technology (CalTech)

Members Absent:

Kevin Guerrero, California Department of Forestry and Fire Protection (CALFIRE)

James Mele, Tuolumne County Sheriff's Office

Guests:

Mitch Medigovich, Deputy Director, Cal OES

Rich Reed, FirstNet

Jeanette Kennedy, FirstNet

Kevin Nida, FirstNet

Scott Andrews, AT&T

Shane Harper, AT&T

Kristi Mercado, AT&T

Meeting Minutes

California First Responder Network Board

October 11, 2017

Cal OES Public Safety Communications, Sacramento, CA

Staff Present:

Budge Carrier, California Statewide Interoperability Coordinator (SWIC)

Paul Dumetz, Public Safety Communications (PSC)

Michael Elder, Public Safety Communications (PSC)

Phillip Killion, Public Safety Communications (PSC)

LJ Nielsen, Public Safety Communications (PSC)

Tim Semenov, Public Safety Communications (PSC)

Monique Shells, Public Safety Communications (PSC)

I. CALL TO ORDER

- Mr. Pat Mallon, California FirstNet SPOC, called the California First Responder Network (CalFRN) Board of Directors meeting to order, and took roll call.

II. APPROVAL OF AUGUST 2017 MEETING MINUTES

- Mr. Kuo-Wei Lee asked for clarification on Caltrans being a primary user. Mr. Mallon said AT&T would need to clarify.
- The August 2017 Meeting Minutes were approved by the Board.

III. STATE PLAN TECHNICAL ADVISORY GROUP UPDATE

- Mr. Barry Fraser commended Cal OES with managing three review teams and conducting a smooth state plan review process. He thanked the CalFRN and review teams for supporting the evaluation in a three day span.

IV. OVERVIEW OF CALIFORNIA STATE PLAN REVIEW RESULTS

- Mr. Budge Carrier provided an overview of California's final state plan review process and results with inputs from the technical advisory group (TAG), Los Angeles

Meeting Minutes

California First Responder Network Board

October 11, 2017

Cal OES Public Safety Communications, Sacramento, CA

Regional Interoperable Communication System Authority (LA-RICS) and Subject Matter Expert (SME) analysis.

- Mr. Currier explained the TAG evaluation was based on scores from three evaluation groups focused on coverage, network performance, and products and services. Scores were weighted based on priorities collected from stakeholder outreach. With scores of 1, 3, and 5 representing does not meet, meets and exceeds California's needs, respectively, the overall weighted TAG score for the plan was 2.0.
- Mr. Currier highlighted LA-RICS' findings and concerns. LA-RICS integration was stated as important from the start. The plan lacks guarantees of network access and hardening. Public safety was looking for FirstNet to be a better solution than what is provided today.
- Mr. Currier highlighted the SME analysis with strengths and weaknesses, as well as impacts to the State. Examples of strengths include more information on site builds, backup power plan, ongoing discussions with the State, clarification on unlimited data plan, and deployable request process. Weaknesses include insufficient coverage, inaccurate maps, a failure to commit to public safety grade, only qualified intent to integrate LA-RICS assets, low number of deployables, and proprietary security policy that can't be reviewed.
- Mr. Currier reviewed California's options of opt-in, opt-out or no decision.
 - Opt-out is not an option. It requires unrealistic subscription connections that exceed the population of public safety users in California, \$3B of

Meeting Minutes

California First Responder Network Board

October 11, 2017

Cal OES Public Safety Communications, Sacramento, CA

spectrum lease payments over 25 years, and penalties exceeding \$15B if the State backs out of deploying the state RAN.

- Opt-in is not an option. There are no guarantees for app interoperability and for sites to be built where coverage is needed with public safety grade hardening. Agencies use multiple carriers because of coverage gaps; apps that require the FirstNet core would not be interoperable.
 - No decision defaults to opt-in after December 28.
- Next step is to provide all available information to the Governor to make a decision.
- Mr. Mitch Medigovich asked about the unrealistic subscription targets. Mr. Mallon explained there are less than 200,000 first responders today in California. In Year 6, FirstNet requires over 200,000 primary subscriptions, which would require 100% adoption and multiple devices per user. Additionally, 100,000 secondary responder subscriptions are required. With the spectrum use charges, it translates to \$75/month per device for 300,000 subscriptions. The numbers feel arbitrary and punitive. Termination penalties reach \$15B without substantiation. FirstNet could not share details of how the numbers are calculated. More conversations with FirstNet are needed.
- Mr. Scott Howland stressed the importance of interoperability. Agencies now use multiple carriers and need apps to work seamlessly across the state. Mr. Barry Fraser concurred, noting that some agencies subscribe to four carriers and need to share data across all networks.

Meeting Minutes

California First Responder Network Board

October 11, 2017

Cal OES Public Safety Communications, Sacramento, CA

- Mr. Nathan Trauernicht also thanked the reviewers, adding that the number of comments shows this is important to public safety, and therefore it was disappointing that some answers from FirstNet were generic.

V. PUBLIC COMMENT

- Motion was approved to begin public comment.
- Mr. David Wiederecht, Verizon Wireless, stated Verizon supports an open, interoperable nationwide arrangement for public safety. Verizon is building a dedicated public safety core and will offer priority and preemption. Verizon will respond if California issues a request for proposal (RFP). Verizon intends to work together with carriers at the app level to allow public safety to realize the benefits of interoperability. Verizon is making investments to be complementary to FirstNet and will compete with AT&T to be the preferred provider for public safety.
- Mr. Daryl Parks, Florida attorney, asked that California at minimum issue an RFP to consider better solutions for the state. Mr. Parks stated AT&T has issues with redlining and overstating service claims, and California should consider all options.
- Mr. Chris Moore, retired San Jose chief of police, noted he has worked at Riva on an alternative to AT&T. From a public safety perspective, he urged the State to issue an RFP as California has no contractual agreement with AT&T and no leverage. Mr. Moore believes California is capable of doing this on its own.
- Mr. Rich Reed, FirstNet Chief Customer Officer, stated his role in delivering the state plans and ensuring customer satisfaction and engagement.

Meeting Minutes

California First Responder Network Board

October 11, 2017

Cal OES Public Safety Communications, Sacramento, CA

- He explained FirstNet estimates there are over 235,000 first responders in California including volunteers. Along with 35,000 federal primary users, there are over 370,000 users in the state. As many users have multiple devices, there is a large potential of device connections.
- FirstNet did their best to answer critical questions, while acknowledgements were given for comments without questions.
- FirstNet's updated consultation letter describes the hardening approach.
- FirstNet as a Long Term Evolution (LTE) network is by nature interoperable; voice, data and text messaging will be interoperable. App level interoperability is different, and FirstNet doesn't want to limit options.
- FirstNet wants to ensure customer satisfaction and will work with the State on the user portal.
- Discussions are ongoing with the National Telecommunications and Information Administration (NTIA) and LA-RICS on assimilation.
- While there are four FirstNet deployables in California, FirstNet has offered states the option to purchase or lease deployables to meet their needs.
- Opt-in is the lowest cost, lowest risk option and the plan is superior to the original solution. The plan delivers many times more than the original 20MHz of spectrum. The state plan portal coverage map shows where AT&T meets the coverage objectives that California requested.
- Mr. Matt Rantanen, Director of Technology for Southern California Tribal Chairmen's Association, said the plan lacks future plans to expand the 79% coverage

Meeting Minutes

California First Responder Network Board

October 11, 2017

Cal OES Public Safety Communications, Sacramento, CA

for tribal lands. From a tribal perspective, he does not support a plan without 100% coverage for tribal lands. Tribes use different carriers and need carrier integration.

VI. CALFRN BOARD RECOMMENDATION

- Mr. Barry Fraser stated given the review team rated the plan an equivalent to a D score, AT&T needs to provide more to get a passing score. He recommended a no decision and a special meeting to review again.
- Motion approved to request additional information from FirstNet and postpone recommendation vote until November 9 special meeting. Plan for 8am closed session and 10am open meeting.

VII. PUBLIC SAFETY ADVISORY COMMITTEE (PSAC) UPDATE

- Mr. Fraser noted there are no current task teams, and the next PSAC meeting will be in December in Atlanta, GA.

VIII. STATEWIDE INTEROPERABILITY COORDINATOR (SWIC) UPDATE

- Mr. Currier noted the statewide communications interoperability plan (SCIP) will be updated pending Governor's decision on FirstNet.

IX. ADJOURN

- Adjourn 11:11am.